#6	Type: T	TF: TF2	Clause: 5.2.5	Page: 34	Line: 14	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved	Response Status: Accept	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

"A VLCPDU with Ethertype Protocol Discrimination (EPD) subtype (Subtype field = 0x0B) is an instantiation of a generic VLCPDU as defined in 5.1, that carries an L3 packet as its payload." Actually, it doesn't have to be L3 packet. It can be any protocol type for which the Higher Layer Protocol Dsicrimanation Entity (HLPDE) in LLC selects the apprpriate client based on Ethertype value. For a refresher, see the attachment in https://www.ieee1904.org/2/email/msg00197.html

Replace "A VLCPDU with Ethertype Protocol Discrimination (EPD) subtype (Subtype field = 0x0B) is an instantiation of a generic VLCPDU as defined in 5.1, that carries an L3 packet as its payload." with "A VLCPDU with Ethertype Protocol Discrimination (EPD) subtype (Subtype field = 0x0B) is an instantiation of a generic VLCPDU as defined in 5.1, that carries the *EthertypeTPID* field as the first field in its payload."

-

#3	Type: T	TF: TF2	Clause: 6.3.2	Page: 46	Line: 10	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved	Response Status: Accept	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

SUBTYPE_OAM and SUBTYPE_OMCI use more descriptive definitions than SUBTYPE_VLC.

Replace SUBTYPE_VLC definition with the following: This constant represents the value of the VLC subtype that identifies VLC_CONFIG VLCPDU as defined in Table 5-1.

-

#1	Type: TR	TF: TF2	Clause: 6.3.4	Page: 46	Line: 32	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved	Response Status: Accept	Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied	Category: -

The intention of comment #47 from D0.9 was to clarify what to do when a frame matched multiple rules. But the final comment resolution also mistakenly removed the sentence "If none of the rules matches the frame, a special value, none, is returned." from the definition of CheckIngressRules() function. This sentence is needed.

Restore the sentence at the end of existing definition. Apply similar definition to CheckEgressRules() function in 6.4.4

-

#4	Type: TR	TF: TF2	Clause: 7.2.2	Page: 56	Line: 1	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved	Response Status: Accept	Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied	Category: -

FID_XPDU_SUBTYPE (as do all FID_XPDU... fields) only exists in the payload of VLCPDU Subtype = SUBTYPE_L2. This field ID is misused in 10 locations where FID_SUBTYPE is supposed to be used. Also, wrong field code values are used in 8A.

1) Replace FID_XPDU_SUBTYPE with FID_SUBTYPE in Tables 7-1, 8A-1, 8A-2, 8A-5, 8A-6, 8A-9, 8A-11, 8A-13, 8A-14, and 8A-15 (all occurences outside of Table 6-2) 2) In Tables 8A-10 and 8A-12, replace "SUBTYPE" with "FID_SUBTYPE" 3) Change field code value associated with FID_SUBTYPE from 0x26 to 0x06 in Tables 8A-2, 8A-6, 8A-10, and 8A-12. 4) Change field code value associated with FID_SUBTYPE from 0x1A to 0x06 in Table 8A-4.   5) Change field code value associated with FID_SUBTYPE from 0x16 to 0x06 in Tables 8A-8.

-

#2	Type: T	TF: TF2	Clause: 8.2	Page: 61	Line: 1	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved	Response Status: Reject	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

As we discussed with the Management attribute contribution, NMS needs to know the 15-bit Rule IDs that identifies an individual rule. Per earlier discussion in tf2_2008 _kramer_1_attributes.pdf (https://www.ieee1904.org/2/email/msg00195.html): Add 15-bit RuleID to rule structure - RuleID is assigned by device that receives a new rule and is reported to VLC Manager in a Response VLCPDU - RuleIDs are unique per port - RuleIDs are permanent for the lifetime of a rule

I do not have a complete proposal ready (so the comment should be rejected), but would like to discuss the general direction: 1) VLC_CONFIG VLCPDU will include 2-octet field RuleId (15 bits are used) 2) In Request messages, this field is set to zero and is ingored on reception. 3) In Response messages, this field is set to actual RuleID assigned by the ONU. The NMS will remmeber these RuleIDs and use them to query various stats later. NMS can Query all rules and get all RuleIds at once. ONU should be the one to choose RuleIDs because it can use the method most appropriate to its internal design, e.g., Index to CTE rule table, address in memory, sequence number in linked list. Anything is OK as long as each rule gets a 15-bit value that is unique per direction per port (i.e, unique per CTE table). More discussion is needed.

No changes to the draft needed at this time.   TF decisions: 1) Removing a rule (both request and response) does not carry the RuleTLV, only RuleID. 2) RuleID value is chosen by device that gets the rule provisioned into (value is vendor-specific). The lifespan of RuleID is the same as the rule itself. 3) Add Object Context TLV that identifies a port on VLC_aware device together with a direction (Tx/Rx). Similar format to PortInstance field.

#5	Type: E	TF: TF2	Clause: 8.2.1	Page: 61	Line: 3	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved	Response Status: Accept	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

sub-clause' (with hyphen) is used in 8.2.1 and 8.2.2. Everywhere else in the draft it is 'subclause' (without hyphen)

Delete hyphen

-