

#20140212_1524 Clause: 13.4.4 Page: Line: - Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Bright House Networks
Comment Status: Under Discussion Category: -

AI from comment #23185 called for an MR on Package A OAM definitions, adding text around the requirement to respond within 1 second, as discussed at December 2013 meeting.

See siepon_1402_hajduczenia_1a for details of changes - two new subclauses are added: one in Clause 13, and one in Clause 14.

Impact = None, it is just formal description of already existing behaviour.

Remove ", with the exception of the ONU's failure to respond to a The OLT shall not deregister the ONU generating the ONU Busy alarm with the exception of the critical TLVs, as defined 14.4.7" from the file"

Postponed till next meeting to clarify the intent for Critcial TLV.

20150819: Curtis & Marek to examine information from DPoE interop / email, initiate discussion on the critical OAM in Package A after the meeting.

#20140915_1447 Clause: 13.4.2 Page: 427 Line: - Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Bright House Networks
Comment Status: Under Discussion Category: -

DPoE-SP-OAMv2-I06 introduces a number of changes to the individual eOAMPDUs: (a) eOAM_MC_Control is modified to control dynamic multicast session on per CPE basis, (b) eOAM_MC_ControlResponse becomes has changes in allocation of response codes, (c) eOAM_MC_Control for static multicast sessions, and (d) eOAM_MC_ControlResponse for static multicast control are added

See 13.4.2.docx with tracked changes.

Impact: New capabilities are added. Existing devices *may* not be able to support all added features.

Use rmtf_1410_hajduczenia_3a.pdf. The status to remain "Under Discussion" until behavior is clarified in DPoE specification.

20150819: On Glen's ToDo list to prepare a contribution on this topic; offline discussion took place.

#20150109-1713 Clause: 14.4.3.6.1.3 Page: 619 Line: - Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom
Comment Status: Under Discussion Category: -

Wrong context objects for aRuleSetConfig attribute.

The aRuleSetConfig attribute is associated with the ONU, PON Port, LLID, UNI Port, or Queue object (see 14.4.1.1).

Per DPoE, it should be only UNI port or PON port.

Replace

"The aRuleSetConfig attribute is associated with the ONU, PON Port, LLID, UNI Port, or Queue object (see 14.4.1.1)."

With

"The aRuleSetConfig attribute is associated with the PON Port or UNI Port object (see 14.4.1.1)."

Impact: ONUs compliant with this MR may reject non-complaint OLT's attempt to set a rule with a wrong context object.

Unknown if any deployments use ONU, LLID, or Queue objects for this attribute.

-

#20150824-1723 Clause: 14.4.5.6.5 Page: 658 Line: - Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom
Comment Status: Under Discussion Category: -

Units for the action acLaserTxPowerOff (0xD9/0x06-05) should be milliseconds, not seconds.

In DPoE 1.0, the units were ms, but inadvertently changed to seconds in DPoE2.0. There has been an ECR submitted against DPoE2.0 to change the units back to ms. SIEPON Package A should align to the new unit value as well.

Using units of milliseconds is a more reasonable approach. It will allow operators to implement automatic troubleshooting methods, where a laser in each ONU can be shut down for a few milliseconds without affecting services. For a manual operation, laser still can be shut down until explicitly enabled.

Change unit of acLaserTxPowerOff (0xD9/0x06-05) action from 1 second to 1 millisecond.

Impact: Changes the expected behavior of acLaserTxPowerOff action, but shall not result in network operation issues.

-

#20150826-1636 Clause: 14.4.3.2.13 Page: 579 Line: - Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom
Comment Status: Under Discussion Category: -

Wrong context object for attribute aOnuLlidQueueConfig (0xD7/0x01-0D).

The context object should be ONU, not the UNI.

DPoE2.0 also shows the ONU object.

In the sentence "The aOnuLlidQueueConfig attribute is associated with the UNI Port object (see 14.4.1.1)." replace "UNI port" with "ONU"

Impact: Probably none. All implementations most likely use the correct context. Using context "UNI" does not make sense.

-

#20150922-1343 Clause: 14.2.2.1 Page: 446 Line: - Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom
Comment Status: Under Discussion Category: -

Editorial issue:
-Five attributes show "Syntax: MAC Address". -Five other attributes show "Syntax: MAC address" (lower case "a" in address)
-Two attributes show "Syntax: IP Address". -Three other attributes show "Syntax: IP address" (lower case "a" in address)
-Six attributes show "Syntax: VLAN Tag". -Three other attributes show "Syntax: VLAN tag" (lower case "t" in tag)
-Three attributes show "Syntax: Vendor-specific". -One attributes shows "Syntax: Vendor specific" (missing hyphen)
Use consistent text:
1) use lower case "address" in all attributes 2) Use lower case "tag" in all attributes 3) use hyphen in "Vendor-specific"
Impact: None
-

#20150923-1338 Clause: 13.4.1.2.2 Page: 421 Line: - Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom
Comment Status: Under Discussion Category: -

Package A TLV definition incorrectly references TLV return codes from Package C.
In text "The eOAMPDU return codes are defined in 13.2.4", change the reference to 13.4.3
Impact: Potential compatibility issues if any of the existing implementations used the wrong return codes.
-

#20151001-1220 Clause: 14.4.3.6.1 Page: 613 Line: - Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom
Comment Status: Under Discussion Category: -

Erroneous definitions of Range for sub-attributes sClause and sResult. Each of these sub-attributes represent a structure consisting of multiple sub-attributes. However, the range is shown as 0x00-0xFF, which is a mistake.
Remove text "Range: 0x00 to 0xFF" from definitions of sub-attributes sClause and sResult. Impact: None. This is clearly a mistake in the specification and it was not possible to implement this mistake in actual devices.
-

#20151005-1648 Clause: 4B Page: 705 Line: - Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom
Comment Status: Under Discussion Category: -

Inconsistent titles for annexes 4A, 4b, and 4C:
Annex 4A (normative) Protocol implementation conformance statement (PICS) for Package A
Annex 4B (normative) PICS for Package B
Annex 4C (normative) PICS for Package C
Make all titles look like title 4A
Impact: none
-

#20151013-1521 Clause: 7.4.2.1 Page: 118 Line: - Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom
Comment Status: Under Discussion Category: -

Wrong message names listed in the IGMP operation: "REPORT MPCPDU" refers to IGMP Membership Report messages.
Replace "REPORT MPCPDU" (2 occurrences) with "REPORT message"
Impact: None
-

#20151013-1530 Clause: 7.4.2.1 Page: 118 Line: - Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom
Comment Status: Under Discussion Category: -

Throughout the document, message names, such as GATE, REPORT, REGISTER, etc., are italicized. However, IGMP messages JOIN, QUERY, and LEAVE are not italicized.
Italicize IGMP message names "JOIN" (19 places), "QUERY" (1), and "LEAVE" (7) (except when used in diagrams)
Impact: None
-

#20151015-2254 Clause: 14.4.1.1.2.4 Page: 554 Line: - Commenter: Lu Yang / RITT, CATR
Comment Status: Under Discussion Category: -

In Object Context TLV, when the ObjectType is UNI Port, ObjectInstance field can take value N to indicate all the UNI ports. In IEEE Std 1904.1/Conformance01-2014, TLV_Context(UNI, N) is used in many places.
change the text in 14.4.1.1.2.4 as proposed in rmtf_1510_lu_1.pdf.
Impact: No
-

#20151022-1318

Clause: 7.4.5

Page: 138

Line: -

Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Under Discussion

Category: -

There are several problems with Package A multicast (see rmtf_1510_knittle_1.pdf):
1) Different mcast groups may need to be identified by different fields. But the aRulelpmcFwrConfig (0xD7/0x05-05) attribute has one value for the entire ONU.
2) The aRulelpmcFwrConfig (0xD7/0x05-05) attribute refers to fields IP-DA and IP-SA. No such fields are defined anywhere. The fields should be IPv4_DA, IPv6_DA, IPv4_SA, and IPv6_SA. It is unclear whether the ONU should create rules to match IPv4, IPv6, or both.
3) Missing configuration messages for non-IP multicast
4) Different UNIs have different numbers and sizes of egress queues, but the eOAM_MC_Control eOAMPDU does not specify which queue should be used at each UNI.
5) eOAM_MC_Control eOAMPDU is different from its counterpart in DPoE
6) Unclear ONU behavior If Multicast Registration message is received, but IP Multicast Config message is not: should frames with given mLLID be dropped or processed using unicast rules?

Also, multicast specifications in DPoE 2.0 and in SIEPON-A have diverged.
This MR attempts to fix the technical issues and restore the alignment between DPoE 2.0 and in SIEPON-A.

The outline of the proposed solution is shown in rmtf_1510_kramer_multicast_outline_1.pdf

The detailed proposed changes are shown in these files:

- 1) Operation description in Clause 7.4.5: rmtf_1510_kramer_multicast_operation_1.pdf
- 2) Classifier support for "LLID value" - rmtf_1510_kramer_multicast_llid_value_1.pdf
- 3) New attributes and actions: rmtf_1510_kramer_multicast_new_attr_1.pdf

Impact: None. Existing multicast specification is unimplementable and multicast based on mLLID has not been deployed yet.

-