IEEE 1904.1-2013 REV, D2.2, Approved Comments (all comments)

Printed on 25 April 2016 at 2:03:01 PM #wg-3-1 Type: E TF: WG Clause: 13.4.1.3.1 Page: 431 Line: 1 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: No In Table 13-83, a new line character is missing before "0x22" Insert new line character #wg-3-2 Type: E Clause: 7.4.5.3.2 TF: WG Line: 35 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: No Category: Missing dot in "i.e," Change to "i.e.," TF: WG Clause: 7.4.5.3.2 Line: 37 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom #wg-3-3 Type: E Page: 141 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: No Category: -**Duplicated** "the" Delete one "the"

#wg-3-4 Type: TR TF: WG Clause: 14.4.2 Line: 17 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom Page: 560 Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Revised Category: -

Some of the basic attributes listed in table 14-132 are not applicable. For example, ONU never receives REGISTER_ACK, REGISTER_REQ, and REPORT MPCPDUs, so these counters are useless.

aMacID attribute is redundant. MAC address of each port can be retrieved through other attributes.

aCollisonFrames attribute is an array of 32 counters. It is optional in 802.3 and should not be shown as mandatory in 1904.1

Modify table 14-132 as shown in rmtf_1604_kramer_1.pdf. Modify table 14-132 as shown in rmtf_1604_kramer_1a.pdf.

Line: 17 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom #wg-3-5 Type: TR TF: WG Clause: 14.4.2 Page: 560 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Revised Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

Basic attributes (branch 0x07) are shown as mandatory, but their definitions are not provided. Information in 802.3 provides description of the behavior, but there is no information of object context, or format of the TLVs. Without this information, interoperability of basic attributes is imporsisble.

Adapt definitions of basic attributes as shown in rmtf_1604_kramer_2.pdf

Adapt definitions of basic attributes as shown in rmtf 1604 kramer 2a.pdf

Clause: 14.4.3 #wg-3-6 Type: E TF: WG Line: 37 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom Page: 564 Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: No Category: -

Empty row between attributes 0x05-04 and 0x05-06

Delete the empty row.