

#13 Type: TR TF: TF2 Clause: - Page: Line: - Commenter: Kevin A. Noll / Tibit Communications

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

Draft is missing text for OMCI in clauses 2, 5, and 7

Add text found in tf2\_2007\_noll\_omci\_baseline.pdf

Use material from tf2\_2007\_noll\_2.pdf for implementation with the following changes: - highlight all TBD values / statements in red - seek missing diagrams from the contributor - remove "OMCI Vendor ID" field - change "OMCI Serial Number" to read OmciOnuSerialNumber This field carries the serial number of the ONU associated with the OMCI message. The serial number is defined in ITU-T Recommendation G.988, 9.1.1. Prune references to ITU recommendations where not needed. Update the Figure 5-1 accordingly. Add material from tf2\_2007\_noll\_2.pdf in location per new draft outline per tf2\_2007\_kramer\_5.pdf.

#9 Type: TR TF: TF2 Clause: 4 Page: 20 Line: 1 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

The terminology "Universal Management Tunnel (UMT)" is inaccurate and needs to be replaced. The tunnels are not universal - they are constrained to Ethernet-based subscriber access networks. The tunnels are not only for management. Also, the term UMT tunnel has a RAS syndrome.

Use the terminology proposed in tf2\_2007\_kramer\_4.pdf.

In the body of the standard and associated figures, make the following changes: - Virtual Link Control (VLC) Sublayer - Virtual Link Control Protocol (VLCP) - VLCPDU - VLC tunnel - Global replacement UMT → VLC Update front matter and title of the standard accordingly. Implement this comment last to make sure all changes to the draft per any other comments are affected by the naming changes

#4 Type: TR TF: TF2 Clause: 6.2 Page: 35 Line: 10 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

Existing text in 6.2 Receive path specification and in 6.3 Transmit path specification is bad. It just shows some disconnected examples of individual ingress/egress entrance/exit rules. The rules are too generic and just show "provisioned MAC addresses" without any explanation how these addresses relate to actual devices that part of UMT tunnel. These rules in isolation don't help. A much clearer explanation is to show matching entrance and exit rules combined per specific use case (as is already done in 7A.1). Then, it is very clear what the provisioned MAC values represent for each tunnel.

1) Replace sections 6.2 and 6.3 with the material provided in tf2\_2007\_kramer\_1.pdf. 2) Replace figure 6-1 with the new figure shown in tf2\_2007\_kramer\_1.pdf. 3) Move section 6.4 to its new location as 6.1.3 4) Delete the highlighted sentence in 6.1 since frames now may not match any rules, but still be modified by UMT sublayer (i.e., to adapt MA\_DATA format to OMCI or UMT PDU interfaces)

Per proposed response, with the following changes in tf2\_2007\_kramer\_1.pdf: - page 4, line 30, is "request()" should be "indication()" In Figure 6.1 add box for multiplexer (Glen to provide updated source file).

#12 Type: TR TF: TF2 Clause: 7 Page: 40 Line: - Commenter: Kevin A. Noll / Tibit Communications

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

Section 7 is missing sections for OAM, L2, L3, etc.

Replace section 7 and other affected text with the text found in tf2\_2007\_d0\_8\_clause\_7\_reorg\_noll\_1.pdf

Make changes to the draft structure per tf2\_2007\_kramer\_5.pdf.

#8 Type: TR TF: TF2 Clause: 8.1 Page: 46 Line: 1 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

MsgSequence was introduced in order to catch missing frames when UMT Request or Response consists of multiple frames. A receiver expects to receive all messages with decrementing MsgSequence until the last message with the value of 0. However, this mechanism does not catch a missing UMT PDU if it is the first frame in a sequence.

Add a flag that indicates that an UMT PDU is the last one in sequence. The exact text is shown in tf2\_2007\_kramer\_3.pdf

#1 Type: ER TF: TF2 Clause: 9 Page: 48 Line: 1 Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

PICS content is missing

Replace Clause 9 with content per tf2\_2007\_hajduczenia\_1.pdf

Replace Clause 9 with content per tf2\_2007\_hajduczenia\_1.pdf Editor has license to capture all new requirements and update PICS for the next version of the draft.

#11 Type: T TF: TF2 Clause: 7A Page: 50 Line: 1 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

Per action items assigned at the last meeting, the following two use case examples are to be added to Annex 7A: 1) OAM over UMT use case, UMT-aware end points 2) OAM over UMT use case, UMT-aware end point + UMT-unaware end point (see [http://www.ieee1904.org/2/meeting\\_archive/2020/06/tf2\\_2006\\_kramer\\_3a.pdf](http://www.ieee1904.org/2/meeting_archive/2020/06/tf2_2006_kramer_3a.pdf))

Add subclauses 7A.2 and 7A.3 as proposed in tf2\_2007\_kramer\_2.pdf

Add subclauses 7A.2 and 7A.3 as proposed in tf2\_2007\_kramer\_2.pdf with the following changes: - Change caption for Figure 7A-3 to read: OAM over UMT use case, one UMT-unaware end point and one UMT-aware end-point

#3 Type: ER TF: TF2 Clause: 7A Page: 50 Line: 1 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

In D0.8, Clause 7 became clause 8, but annex number remained 7A.

Change the annex number to 8A.

#2 Type: TR TF: TF2 Clause: 7A.1.1 Page: 50 Line: 11 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

Incorrect caption in Figure 7A-1.

Replace "UMTPDU format" with "OAM over UMT use case, UMT-unaware end points"

#10 Type: E TF: TF2 Clause: 7A.1.1 Page: 51 Line: 4 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

There are two subclauses numbered 7A.1.1

The second subclause should be 7A.1.2. Also make sure that all subsequent subclauses get incremented too.

#5 Type: TR TF: TF2 Clause: 7A.1.1.3 Page: 55 Line: 6 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied Category: -

The Note under table 7A-5 says "S - MAC address of Manager M". It should say be MAC address M.

Replace "S" with "M"

-

#6 Type: E TF: TF2 Clause: 7A.1.2 Page: 59 Line: 3 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

Missing dot after the word "exit".

Add a dot.

-

#7 Type: E TF: TF2 Clause: 7A.1.2.1 Page: 59 Line: 13 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Resolved Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

"The contents of a UMT\_CONFIG UMTPDU that deletes the UMT tunnel exit rule at the egress of Bridge Y, port 0 is identical to the UMT\_CONFIG UMTPDU shown in Table 7A-4,..." Plural "contents" used with singular "is". The same issue is present on lines 18, 22, and 27

Either delete "contents of a" or change "is" to "are". Apply the change to all 4 locations.

Delete "contents of a" in four indicated locations