#13   Type: TR   TF: TF2   Clause: -   Page: Line: -   Commenter: Kevin A. Noll / Tibit Communications

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: AIP   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

Draft is missing text for OMCI in clauses 2, 5, and 7
Add text found in tf2_2007_noll_omci_baseline.pdf
Use tf2_2007_noll_2.pdf for implementation with the following changes: - highlight all TBD values / statements in red - seek missing diagrams from the contributor

#9   Type: TR   TF: TF2   Clause: 4   Page: 20   Line: 1   Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: AIP   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

The terminology "Universal Management Tunnel (UMT)" is inaccurate and needs to be replaced. The tunnels are not universal - they are constrained to Ethernet-based subsriber access networks. The tunnels are not only for management. Also, the term UMT tunnel has a RAS syndrome.
Use the terminology proposed in tf2_2007_kramer_4.pdf.
In the body of the standard and associated figures, make the following changes: – Virtual Link Control (VLC) Sublayer – Virtual Link Control Protocol (VLCP) – VLCPDU – VLC tunnel – Global replacement UMT ➜ VLC Update front matter and title of the standard accordingly.   Implement this comment last to make sure all changes to the draft per any other comments are affected by the naming changes

#4   Type: TR   TF: TF2   Clause: 6.2   Page: 35   Line: 10 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

Existing text in 6.2 Receive path specification and in 6.3 Transmit path specification is bad. It just shows some disconnected examples of individual ingress/egress entrance/exit rules. The rules are too generic and just show "provisioned MAC addresses" without any explanation how these addresses relate to actual devices that part of UMT tunnel. These rules in isolation don't help. A much clearer explanation is to show matching entrance and exit rules combined per specific use case (as is already done in 7A.1). Then, it is very clear what the provisioned MAC values represent for each tunnel.
1) Replace sections 6.2 and 6.3 with the material provided in tf2_2007_kramer_1.pdf. 2) Replace figure 6-1 with the new figure shown in tf2_2007_kramer_1.pdf. 3) Move section 6.4 to its new location as 6.1.3 4) Delete the highlighted sentence in 6.1 since frames now may not match any rules, but still be modified by UMT sublayer (i.e., to adapt MA_DATA format to OMCI or UMTPDU interfaces)
-

#12   Type: TR   TF: TF2   Clause: 7   Page: 40   Line: -   Commenter: Kevin A. Noll / Tibit Communications

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: AIP   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

Section 7 is missing sections for OAM, L2, L3, etc.
Replace section 7 and other affected text with the text found in tf2_2007_d0_8_clause_7_reorg_noll_1.pdf
Use the following contribution tf2_2007_noll_1a.pdf with the following changes: - material from D08 subclause 7.2 seems to have been moved as a whole into new subclause 7.2.4 - confirm with contributor whether that is indeed the case - add <<TBD>> into each and every empty subclause

#8   Type: TR   TF: TF2   Clause: 8.1   Page: 46   Line: 1   Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

MsgSequence was introduced in order to catch missing frames when UMT Request or Response consists of multiple frames. A receiver expects to receive all messages with decrementing MsgSequence until the last message with the value of 0. However, this mechanism does not catch a missing UMTPDU if it is the first frame in a sequence.
Add a flag that indicates that an UMTPDU is the last one in sequence. The exact text is shown in tf2_2007_kramer_3.pdf
-

#1   Type: ER   TF: TF2   Clause: 9   Page: 48   Line: 1   Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

PICS content is missing
Replace Clause 9 with content per tf2_2007_hajduczenia_1.pdf
-

#11   Type: T   TF: TF2   Clause: 7A   Page: 50   Line: 1   Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

Per action items assigned at the last meeting, the following two use case examples are to be added to Annex 7A: 1) OAM over UMT use case, UMT-aware end points 2) OAM over UMT use case, UMT-aware end point + UMT-unaware end point (see http://www.ieee1904.org/2/meeting_archive/2020/06/tf2_2006_kramer_3a.pdf)
Add subclauses 7A.2 and 7A.3 as proposed in tf2_2007_kramer_2.pdf
-

#3   Type: ER   TF: TF2   Clause: 7A   Page: 50   Line: 1   Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

In D0.8, Clause 7 became clause 8, but annex number remained 7A.
Change the annex number to 8A.
-

#2   Type: TR   TF: TF2   Clause: 7A.1.1   Page: 50   Line: 11 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

Incorrect caption in Figure 7A-1.
Replace "UMTPDU format" with "OAM over UMT use case, UMT-unaware end points"
-

#10   Type: E   TF: TF2   Clause: 7A.1.1   Page: 51   Line: 4   Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed   Response Status: Accept   Commenter Satisfaction: None   Category: -

There are two subclauses numbered 7A.1.1
The second subclause should be 7A.1.2. Also make sure that all subsequent subclauses get incremented too.
-

#5	Type: TR	TF: TF2	Clause: 7A.1.1.3	Page: 55	Line: 6	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed	Response Status: Accept	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

The Note under table 7A-5 says "S - MAC address of Manager M". It should say be MAC address M.

Replace "S" with "M"

-

#6	Type: E	TF: TF2	Clause: 7A.1.2	Page: 59	Line: 3	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed	Response Status: Accept	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

Missing dot after the word "exit".

Add a dot.

-

#7	Type: E	TF: TF2	Clause: 7A.1.2.1	Page: 59	Line: 13	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed	Response Status: AIP	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

"The contents of a UMT_CONFIG UMTPDU that deletes the UMT tunnel exit rule at the egress of Bridge Y, port 0 is identical to the UMT_CONFIG UMTPDU shown in Table 7A-4,…" Plural "contents" used with singular "is". The same issue is present on lines 18, 22, and 27

Either delete "contents of a" or change "is" to "are". Apply the change to all 4 locations.

Delete "contents of a" in four indicated locations