

#8 Type: E TF: TF2 Clause: 3.1 Page: 16 Line: 6 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

"Link layer data traffic" needs a hyphen "link-layer" (compound adjective)

Add hyphen

-

#4 Type: E TF: TF2 Clause: 6.2.1.2 Page: 42 Line: 4 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

In Table 6-3, "target_" is misspelled as "taget_..." 12 occurrences

Fix the typo

-

#9 Type: E TF: TF2 Clause: 6.3.1 Page: 45 Line: 8 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

Use of deprecated word "will"

In sentence "Note that there still may be other local clients that will intercept/consume these xPDUs at a higher layer." replace "will" with "are able to"

-

#1 Type: TR TF: TF2 Clause: 8 Page: 58 Line: 1 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

As was discussed at the last meeting, the VLC Management needs to know the 15-bit Rule IDs that identify individual rules. The attached contribution tf2_2010_kramer_2_clean.pdf implements the TF decision regarding the RuleId field, as recorded in the resolution of comment #2 against D1.0.

Apply changes to clause 8 and Annex 8A as shown in tf2_2010_kramer_2_diff.pdf. The clean version is shown in tf2_2010_kramer_2_clean.pdf for reference.

-

#6 Type: E TF: TF2 Clause: 8.1.2 Page: 60 Line: 9 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

We renamed operation "Changed" as "Replace"

In Table 8-4, replace "Add/Change" with "Add/Replace"

-

#5 Type: E TF: TF2 Clause: 8.1.2 Page: 60 Line: 9 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

In Table 8-4, "1" in Field Size column for FieldCode field is italicized erroneously.

Remove italics.

-

#2 Type: T TF: TF2 Clause: 8.2 Page: 61 Line: 1 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Reject Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

We have a bit of syntactic absurdity within all the tables that provide definitions of rules (my doing, mostly). For example, consider this line: FID_SUBTYPE == SUBTYPE_OAM. FID_SUBTYPE is a constant with the value of 0x06. SUBTYPE_OAM is a constant with a value of 0x03. These two constants are never the same, so this condition is always false. Similar constructs (comparing two unequal constants) are used in every rule definition table. This is not a technical problem, just a matter of representation and definitions.

I do not have a complete proposal ready (so the comment should be rejected), but would like to brainstorm how to tackle this. Will try to provide a high level suggestion before the meeting.

No specific changes to the draft needed at this time.

-

#3 Type: TR TF: TF2 Clause: 8.2.1 Page: 61 Line: 12 Commenter: KEVIN A NOLL / TIBIT COMMUNICATIONS

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: AIP Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

The protocol for attribute queries should allow protocols other than OAM.

Change the sentence to read: The protocol used to set and query these management attributes is outside the scope of this standard. It is generally assumed that the OAM protocol defined in IEEE Std 802.3 and extended in IEEE Std 1904.1 is supported, but other protocols, such as Netconf and SNMP may be supported, also.

Change the existing sentence The protocol used to set and query these management attributes is outside the scope of this standard, although the OAM protocol defined in IEEE Std 802.3 and extended in IEEE Std 1904.1 is generally assumed. to read: The protocol used to set and query these management attributes is outside the scope of this standard. It is generally assumed that the OAM protocol defined in IEEE Std 802.3 and extended in IEEE Std 1904.1 is supported, but other protocols, such as Netconf and SNMP may be also supported.

#7 Type: E TF: TF2 Clause: 8A.2.1 Page: 78 Line: 9 Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: Proposed Response Status: Accept Commenter Satisfaction: None Category: -

Typo in "awarness"

Should be "awareness" (add "e" after "r")

-