IEEE 1904.2 VLC, D2.1, Received Comments (all comments)
Printed on 12/11/2020 at 6:47:06 AM

#1 Type: TR	TF: TF2 Clause: 6.4	Page: 48 Line: 1 C	commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom
Comment Status: New	Response Status: None	Commenter Satisfaction: Non	ne Category: -
"There are several issues with the Transmit process specification and behavior: 1) The variables DstAddr, SrcAddr, LengthType, and Subtype are not defined in subclause 6.4.3. 2) Nothing in MAC specification prevents a frame with DA=LOCAL_MAC_ADDR from being transmitted. Thus, a frame with a temporary placeholder for the DstAddr field may get transmitted (if a rule to overwrite the DA has not been setup), and in the worst case, that could generate a broadcast storm. 3) In most cases, we don't need an egress rule for setting the DstAddr for outbound frames. The MAC address of the peer entity can be learned from the SrcAddr field of the previously received VLCPDU. "			
"1) Add missing definitions, as shown in subclause 6.4.3 in tf2_2012_kramer_1.pdf 2) For DstAddr field placeholder use sentinel value NULL_MAC_ADDR that is different from LOCAL_MAC_ADDR. Before an outbound frame is passed to MAC sublayer, check that it has all necessary fields and that the DstAddr != NULL_MAC_ADDR. Otherwise, discard this frame. 3) Add variables VIsPeerAddr and OmciPeerAddr to hold the SrcAddr values of VLCPDUs with SUBTYPE_VLC or SUBTYPE_OMCI received by the Receive process on the same port. Use these values as the default DstAddr. These value can still be overwritten by CTE egress rules, if needed. But if these values are correct, no egress rule is necessary. The exact proposed changes are shown in tf2_2012_kramer_1.pdf"			

Page 1 of 1