#1	Type: TR	TF: TF4	Clause: 9.3.6.1	Page: 208	Line: 7	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: New	Response Status: None	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

The draft has one instance of OUI_B and seven instances of OUI_C.

Replace with OUI_1904_4

-

#5	Type: ER	TF: TF4	Clause: 13.3.2.3	Page: 234	Line: 4	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: New	Response Status: None	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

Wrong figure numbering

Figures 12-2, 12-3, and 12-4 shall be numbered 13-2, 13-3, and 13-4.

-

#6	Type: T	TF: TF4	Clause: 13.3.2.3.6	Page: 238	Line: 30	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: New	Response Status: None	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

Uncliear what is meant by the following sentence "The state diagram in Figure 12-3 is instantiated for every group of eOAM versions identified by a different OUI" The subclause 13.3.2 states that "The eOAM discovery process is executed once per ONU.". Shouldn't then the state diagram be instantiated for each ONU?

Consider removing this statement. Otherwise, clarify how the OLT shall support multiple state diagrams with different OUIs. How shall ONU react to eOAMPDUs that contain an unrecognized OUI? What other OUI can be allowed by this state diagram, given the primite definitions allow only one OUI? In the preceding sentence "The C-OLT shall implement the extended OAM discovery process as shown in Figure 12-3 for each newly discovered L-ONU", replace "implement" with "instantiate"

-

#2	Type: TR	TF: TF4	Clause: 13.3.2.3.6	Page: 238	Line: 32	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: New	Response Status: None	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

The sentence "In the case of an mL-ONU, the extended OAM discovery process shall be executed for every registering L-ONU" is not true for the 802.3ca ONUs. The OAM discovery is done once per C-ONU.

Delete the sentence

-

#3	Type: T	TF: TF4	Clause: 13.4.3.2	Page: 244	Line: 14	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: New	Response Status: None	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

"The number of elements in the sequence list shall be determined from the size of the given Variable Container (value of the Length field)." This is a mis-stated requirement. Who shall do the determination and when?

Change the sentence to this: "The number of elements in the sequence list is determined from the size of the given Variable Container (value of the Length field)." Remove the corresponding PICS.

-

#4	Type: TR	TF: TF4	Clause: 13.4.4.1	Page: 244	Line: 33	Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom

Comment Status: New	Response Status: None	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

In 13.3.2.3, the draft says "Step 2: The ONU responds to the received eOAM_Discovery message by sending the list of supported versions of the management software...". Also the Figure 12-2 shows multiple OAM version being exchanged. The state diagrams use variables versionListONU and versionListOLT. In the OLT, the value of versionListONU is extracted from the Entended Information TLV received from the ONU. But the format of the Extended Information TLV in 13.4.4.1 only allows one OAM version to be carried in this TLV.

Replace the entire subclause 13.4.4.1 with subclause 13.2.2.3.1 from IEEE 1904.1-2017. Rename OUI_C into OUI_1904_4.

-

#7	Type: TR	TF: TF4	Clause: Annex 4A	Page: 419	Line: 1	Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter

Comment Status: New	Response Status: None	Commenter Satisfaction: None	Category: -

PICS for Clause 13 and Vlause 14 need to be leaned up and aligned with the current text of the standard

Replace the following subclauses per 4A.2.10, 4A.2.11, 4A.2.12, and 4A.2.13 for the ONU side, and 4A.3.8, 4A.3.9, 4A.3.10, and 4A.3.11 for the OLT side, as shown in tf4_2112_hajduczenia_01.pdf

-