| #5 | Type: T | TF: TF4 | Clause: 6 | Page: 60 | Line: 1 | Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|

Comment Status: Resolved    Response Status: AIP    Commenter Satisfaction: None    Category: -

The Clause 6 remains identical to C6 in IEEE 1904.1-2017. We can remove it and simply reference 1904.1

Replace all the text in C6 with the following:  "This clause is intentionally left empty. The reference model of the ONU/OLT MAC Client is provided in IEEE Std 1904.1, Clause 6." Replace all references to clause 6 or its subclauses with external references to the same subclauses in IEEE 1904.1.

Replace all the text in C6 with the following:  "The reference model of the ONU/OLT MAC Client is defined in IEEE Std 1904.1, Clause 6."   Replace all references to clause 6 or its subclauses with external references to the same subclauses in IEEE 1904.1.

---

| #8 | Type: TR | TF: TF4 | Clause: 9.3.3.1.2 | Page: 199 | Line: 20 | Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|

Comment Status: Resolved    Response Status: Accept    Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied    Category: -

"...the ONU enters the local deregistration state by sending the MCSR( MsgRegisterReq ) primitive with the MsgRegisterReq.Flag set to NACK primitive to the underlying MPCP sublayer..."  The MCSR(MsgRegsiterReq) primitive is not defined in this draft. Instead, we use MACR(REGISTER_REQ,...)

Use the following text: "the ONU enters the local deregistration state by sending the<cn> MACR( REGISTER_REQ, status)</cn> primitive with the<cn> status</cn> parameter set to NACK, per Figure 9-8."

-

---

| #9 | Type: TR | TF: TF4 | Clause: 9.3.3.2.5 | Page: 202 | Line: 3 | Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|

Comment Status: Resolved    Response Status: Accept    Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied    Category: -

The statement MACR( DA, REGISTER_REQ, deregister ) in state diagram in Figure 9-8 is incorrect. In 802.3ca, the Flag field only takes ACK or NACK values.Also, according to the definition of MACR primitive in 9.3.3.2.4, the DA parameter is not used.

In state FORCE_DEREGISTER, replace "MACR( DA, REGISTER_REQ, deregister )" with "MACR( REGISTER_REQ, NACK )"

-

---

| #10 | Type: T | TF: TF4 | Clause: 9.3.4.5.2 | Page: 212 | Line: 32 | Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|

Comment Status: Resolved    Response Status: Accept    Commenter Satisfaction: None    Category: -

"MPCP (0x00-00-00-02): indicates that the mpcp_timeout condition, as defined in 32 IEEE Std 802.3, 64.3.4.2..." Also p213/L23  802.3ca does not track MPCP timeout. Instead, it counts missing REPORTs

Use the following text on page 212: "MPCP (0x00-00-00-02): indicates that the unresponsive MPCP condition is observed by the backup L-OLT or by the backup L-ONU. The MPCP is considered unresponsive when the number of missed REPORT MPCPDUs exceeds the<cn> MISSED_REPORT_LIMIT</cn> (see IEEE Std 802.3, 144.3.7.1)."  Use the following text on page 213: "MPCP (0x00-00-00-02): indicates that the unresponsive MPCP condition is observed by the primary L-OLT or by the primary L-ONU. The MPCP is considered unresponsive when the number of missed REPORT MPCPDUs exceeds the<cn> MISSED_REPORT_LIMIT</cn> (see IEEE Std 802.3, 144.3.7.1)."

-

---

| #3 | Type: TR | TF: TF4 | Clause: 9.3.4.5.4 | Page: 214 | Line: 24 | Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|

Comment Status: Resolved    Response Status: Accept    Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied    Category: -

In D1.0, the definition of the Event Notification TLV was corrected to show missing fields EventTimestamp and EventInfo. But the TLV lebgth was not corrected and is wrong now.

In the definition of eOAMI_Switch_Event() on page 214, change the SIEPON_Event_TLV.Length from 0x06 to 0x11  Apply the same change to the definition of eOAMR_Switch_Event( failureCode ) on page 215

-

---

| #6 | Type: TR | TF: TF4 | Clause: 10 | Page: 219 | Line: 1 | Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|

Comment Status: Resolved    Response Status: Accept    Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied    Category: -

Per earlier decisions, the power saving mode should only include the Tx-mode and it should be always enabled. Most of the required behavior is already added by subclauses 8.4.4.1 (REPORT supression) and 8.4.4.2 (upstream burst supression).  Clause 10 only need to show how this behavior can be used to save power.

1) Replace clause 10 with the text provided in tf4_2210_kramer_1_power_saving.pdf 2) Replace attribute aOnuPwrSavingCap (0xDB/0xFF-FF) with aOnuPowerSavingConfig (0xDB/0x0A-00) per tf4_2210_kramer_2_power_attribute.pdf 3) Delete unused OAMPDUs in sections 13.4.6.8, 13.4.6.9, and 13.4.6.10 4) Update relevant PICS

-

---

| #2 | Type: E | TF: TF4 | Clause: 12 | Page: 234 | Line: 1 | Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|

Comment Status: Resolved    Response Status: AIP    Commenter Satisfaction: None    Category: -

Clause 12 is still empty and hanging around

Remove empty Clause 12 stub and renumber material in Clause 13 and Clause 14 one number down

Add the following text in C12:  "This clause is intentionally left empty to maintain the clause numbering consistent with IEEE Std 1904.1."

---

| #7 | Type: E | TF: TF4 | Clause: 14.4.1.22 | Page: 328 | Line: 1 | Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|

Comment Status: Resolved    Response Status: Accept    Commenter Satisfaction: None    Category: -

Several grammatical issues in the following text: "NOTE-- This attribute is intended mainly for testing and troubleshooting. Under the normal operation coditions, this attribute is expected to retain its default value.."

1) remove duplicated period at the end 2) "operation conditions" should be "operating conditions" 3) missing 'n' in "conditions"

-

---

| #1 | Type: ER | TF: TF4 | Clause: 4A.2.3 | Page: 433 | Line: 1 | Commenter: Marek Hajduczenia / Charter |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|

Comment Status: Resolved    Response Status: Accept    Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied    Category: -

There are multiple PICS entries that need to be updated to match the latest draft structure and content, including: - changes to upstream / downstream queue service mechanisms were adopted into the body of the standard but PICS were not updated - exisitng PICS for REPORT MPCPDU structure, Report queue length calculation, Queue service discipline needs to be removed

Adopt changes to PICS as shown in tf4_2210_hajduczenia_1.pdf

-

| #4 | Type: TR | TF: TF4 | Clause: 4A.3.18 | Page: 495 | Line: 1 | Commenter: Glen Kramer / Broadcom |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|

Comment Status: Resolved    Response Status: Accept        Commenter Satisfaction: Satisfied            Category: -

Trunk_1 and Trunk_2 are undefined. PICS T-LPTK4b is incorrect

Use the following PICS text:  T-LPTK4a | Trunk protection process operating on the OLT | 9.3.3.2.5 | The C-OLT instantiates the switching process state diagram as defined in Figure 9-7. | T-LPTK0:M  T-LPTK4b | Trunk protection with protected clients at the OLT | 9.3.3.2.5 | The combined operation of both primary and backup C-OLTs is as defined in Figure 9-7. | T-LPTK0:M

-